



Human Development *Network*

The Nuts and Bolts of Designing and Implementing Training Programs in Developing Countries

Maddalena Honorati and Thomas McArdle

The World Bank

**IZA-World Bank-OECD Conference on Activation and Employment Support
Policies**

May 1, 2012

Objective

- Document key factors of success in program design and implementation
 - Which are the design and implementation features of training programs that work best –generating gains for participants that are large enough to justify their costs?
 - And which are less successful?
- The ultimate goal is to inform new program design and guide practitioners setting up their interventions.
 - A practical, orderly, hands-on guide to the elements of program design and implementation
 - With examples from projects around the world
 - Aimed somewhat more at practitioners

Context and Rationale to training provision

- Training programs are potential solutions to the problem of lack of job-relevant skill (technical, cognitive, non-cognitive)
 - ...the “right” skills for jobs, which are the ones demanded by employers
 - rationale for Government involvement
- Four trends that have greatly influenced the design and implementation of training programs:
 - Demand-led training
 - Lifelong Learning paradigm
 - Competency-based training
 - Emergence of National Qualification Frameworks

Overview

- Scope of training programs and target groups
- What do we know from existing evidence?
- How To Design a Training Program?
 - Identifying target groups
 - Select the type of training and delivery modality
 - Qualification of service providers
 - Assessment of learning
- Implementation Challenges
 - Recruitment and beneficiary selection
 - Selection of providers
 - Implementation arrangements for program sustainability, governance
 - Support services to training programs

Scope of training programs

- **Publicly-supported** programs
 - direct provision (through public training institutes)
 - financial support (funding training costs and subsidizing trainees)
- Targeted to **vulnerable people**
- **Short** in duration (6 months, maximum a year)
- **Voluntary** in nature
- Programs that address lack of:
 1. **Basic skills** (literacy and numeracy)
 2. **Vocational and technical skills**
 3. **Life skills**
 4. **Basic job readiness skills**
 5. **Entrepreneurial skills**

What do we know from existing evidence?

- Second chance programs are more successful when they provide some **certification**
- Success of vocational and technical training programs is deeply related with the content of the skills provided (**demand-driven design**) and with **on-the job** training
 - Complementing trainings with a personalized counseling and customized job search assistance is also associated with higher program performance.
- Anecdotal evidence from employers surveys around the world suggest that **life skills** are of increasing importance to how a person is viewed by employers
- Training programs supporting **entrepreneurship** show different results depending on target population groups (positive on business creation and knowledge, mixed on profits, income of existing entrepreneurs)
- Generally, **cost-effectiveness** still remains to be tested.

Program Design

- Identifying and Profiling Beneficiaries
- Selecting the type of Training Programs
- Training Delivery Modalities
- Training Plans
- Training Program Duration
- Qualification of service providers and quality assurance of training
- Assessment of Learning

Identifying Beneficiaries

- Disadvantaged youth, including school dropouts and graduates who have difficulty entering the labor market (*Jovenes*)
- The long term unemployed
- Vulnerable women and single parent females (AGI)
- The Poor (including social assistance beneficiaries) (Nicaragua)
- Workers in the informal sector (Sri Lanka)
- Displaced workers (Serbia)
- Mass lay-off workers (Romania)
- Street & working children, orphans, neglected children (Yemen)
- Prisoners & offenders leaving the correctional system (Morocco)
- Conflict Affected People (Sierra Leone)
- Migrant Workers (China)
- People with disabilities (Turkey)
- Minority groups

Identifying Beneficiaries

- Emerges from a social context-a problem
- Eligibility criteria define the target group:
 - Employments status, age, gender, education, income, previous training, geographic location or social group
- Define advocacy, quotas
- Use of Registries: social assistance, UI registry, poverty maps

Profiling Beneficiaries

- Identifying the type of skills constraints
- Identifying special support services:
 - Job preparation and job placement counseling
 - Appropriate orientation in terms of realistic job opportunities and requirements
 - Provision of specialized services: stipend support, access to child care, and transportation assistance, assistance to disability learning

Training Programs' Typology

Constraints	Type of Training
Insufficient basic cognitive skills	Literacy and numeracy, “second chance” training
Lack of job-specific skills, technical skills mismatch	Technical & Vocational
Lack of behavioral skills relevant for jobs	Life Skills
Job searching strategies and techniques	Basic job readiness skills, ICT
Insufficient entrepreneurial skills	Entrepreneurial

Training Delivery Modalities

- On-the-Job only
 - Apprenticeship
 - Work Experience
- Institution-based only
- Comprehensive: Institution based + On the job internship training

Selecting the type of training program

- Address target group skills needs
- Relevance to the local labor market structure (demand led training)
 - What industries and job categories are growing? How much do these jobs pay? Opportunities for entry-level entrepreneurship?
- Type of outcome desired (wage employment , self-employment)

Adjust design to country institutional capacity

- Type of training providers: existing gov. institutions, NGOs and private providers, skilled master crafts persons
- Assessment of public institutional capacity and national training system
 - Does a National Qualification Framework exist?
 - Qualification of Training Providers & QA of Training: pre-qualification vs. rigorous approval
 - Is a national certification system in place? Are assessors available?
 - Is there a market for private training providers?

Implementation of Training Programs

- *Marketing a new program*
- *Recruitment process and beneficiaries selection*
- *Enrolment, Registration and Orientation*
- *Selection of training providers*
- *Conducting a training program*
- *Curricula & Training Materials*
- *Support Services to Training Programs*
- *Implementation Arrangements*
- *Institutional arrangements, partners, sustainability and scalability*
- *Governance*
- *Incentives for stakeholders*
- *Payment and compensation*
- *Complaint mechanisms*
- *Costs and Financing*
- *Monitoring & Evaluation (M&E)*
- *What Goes Wrong / Main implementation challenges*

Implementation of Training Programs

- Recruitment & Selection:
 - Committees, Random selection, “Creaming” (even of the disadvantaged)
 - Transparency
 - Ensuring Inclusion: quotas, incentives, proportional selection

Implementation of Training Programs

- Selection of training providers
 - Competitive procurement: evaluation criteria, bids, selection process, contracts

Implementation of Training Programs

Support services

- Counseling, Job fairs, orientation
- Job Preparation & Job Placement
- Mentoring
- Services for self-employment, access to start-up capital

Implementation Arrangements

Configuration of implementing actors:

- Implementing agency (government agency, NGO)-
Admin., M&E, financial management
- Governance bodies (training councils, Ministries...,
NTAs)
- Training providers (Private, public)
- Employers
- Sometimes competing/cooperating/ complementary
government agencies (Education for Employment-
MENA, Grenada) for sustainability & scalability

Governance & Incentives to program stakeholders

Firms: Reducing costs of involvement-tools, supplies, TNA & Planning, Mentorship training

Training Providers: performance based contracts: milestones, per-individual certified / placed, complementary services

Beneficiaries: Daily stipends, (banking, cell phone credits)

Payment Arrangements

Pay Training Providers-pay for performance, milestone payments and per individual

Vouchers- Given to beneficiaries, introduces a new competitive element (Kenya)

M&E

M&E, MIS, Results framework-Example- Turkey, ISKUR

Established MIS made more user friendly, scaled up to perform better for reporting, comparing courses & regions, performance management

What Goes Wrong in Implementing a Training Program?

- Not sufficiently involving employers, not listening to what employers say, and responding to employers' needs too slowly
- Too little emphasis on job placement
- Choosing the wrong skill areas (LMI)
- High drop out rate
 - Inadequate stipends
 - Selecting applicants not ready to benefit, or placed in a skill area that does not actually interest them
- Coordination among agencies/partners, wrong arrangements
- Communication issues among stakeholders

What Goes Wrong in Implementing a Training Program?

- Too few or too many applicants
- Difficulties finding the right instructors
- Delays in paying stipends to learners and making payments to providers
- Difficulties recruiting employers and especially the more desirable employers
- Not having the certification procedures and arrangements in place

Getting it Right

- Improve the knowledge and skills of the main implementation actors
- Improve screening of beneficiaries
- Get better training providers involved and submitting proposals
- Identify gaps in the services and fill them
- Improve administration of payments

Getting it Right

- Improve assessors' performance and increase the number of assessors
- Adjust payment amounts by reviewing and understanding the real unit costs, and differentiating payment amounts according to the kind of training and
- Gradually get more and better employers involved.